



THE JEWISH PRESS

Friday, August 26, 2005

21 Av 5765

Prayer

(Continued from Front Page)

The prayer for the State of Israel serves four functions, each important and yet distinct from the others.

First, the prayer reflects our innermost feelings about the need to pray for the well-being and security of all of our institutions in general, and the State of Israel in particular. We recognize that the State of Israel remains besieged by its enemies and is continuously forced to defend itself militarily, and we beseech the Almighty to insure that Israel remains secure.

Like the custom for Jews to pray for the welfare of the society in which they live and its government, we similarly pray that the State of Israel remains strong and successful.

Second, the Prayer for the State of Israel reflects our belief and our hope that the State of Israel is the beginning of our redemption. Indeed, as noted by Rav Yitzchak Isaac Leibes, *zt"l*, (*Beit Avi* 5:69) the term "*reishit tzemichat geulateinu*" ("the beginning of our redemption") reflects not our certainty that such must be true, but our hopes and prayers that such could be true.

As the Gerer Rebbe noted at the time of Israel's war for independence, it is the nature of the Jewish people to be redeemed little by little.

Third, the Prayer for the State of Israel allows the Torah-observant community to address the proper relationship between those Jews still residing in the diaspora and those living in the land of Israel. The prayer recognizes that our Maker's blessings are needed also for Jews living in exile, and that we await our redemption and our return to Israel.

Finally, we say the Prayer for the State of Israel as a way of thanking the Almighty for the good He has given to us by the establishment of the State of Israel. We recognize that we live in a privileged time, when the Jewish people are sovereign over the land of Israel for the first time since the destruction of the *Beit Hamikdash* more than 1,900 years ago.

Prayer to the Lord, as thanksgiving for what we have and what He has given us, is one of the ways we show appreciation. The founding and continued existence of the State of Israel is an event of unparalleled significance in the last 2,000 years of Jewish history, and if we do not thank the Almighty for that which He gives us, our prophets teach us that we risk having Him take those things away.

These four factors alone seem sufficient to justify reciting the Prayer for the State of Israel, and this is the custom throughout vast segments of the Orthodox community in the United States.

Why, however, should this particular Prayer for the State of Israel be said? Maybe some other prayer would be more appropriate? Indeed, those who have participated in services in British synagogues recognize that the Prayer for the State of Israel commonly recited in England, and written by the late chief rabbi of England, Rabbi Israel Brodie, *zt"l*, is significantly different from the prayer commonly recited in the United States (and Israel). The British Prayer for the State of Israel reads as follows:

May He who blessed our fathers, Abraham, Isaac and Jacob, bless the State of Israel, its leaders and advisors in the land which He swore unto our fathers to give us. Put into their hearts the love and fear to uphold it with justice and righteousness, to serve You in truth and sincerity. May we be worthy in our days to witness the fulfillment of the words of Your servants, the prophets: "For out of Zion shall go forth Torah, and the word of the Lord from Jerusalem." Grant peace in Your holy land and everlasting

happiness unto all its inhabitants, so that Jacob shall again have peace and tranquility with no one to make him afraid. Spread the canopy of peace on all dwellers of the earth. May this be your will and let us say Amen.

Others have suggested that the common Prayer for the State of Israel (written by Rav Herzog and quoted at the beginning of this essay) should not be used, because the words "*reishit tzemichat geulateinu*" ("the beginning of our redemption") can be understood as a call for messianic Zionism or is intended as a prophecy, and thus either the entire prayer or just this phrase should not be said by those who do not believe that Israel must be the beginning of our redemption.

Rabbi Norman Lamm, *shlit"l*, has stated that he favors using the British version of the prayer in many contexts because "it is less ideologically demanding; it makes not assumptions about the Messianic nature of the State of Israel. Thus, even those who are hesitant about committing themselves to clear knowledge of our position in God's redemptive process can join in thanksgiving for his benevolence in reestablishing our national dignity."

Others have suggested that the common Prayer for the State of Israel should not be used, because the words 'the beginning of our redemption' can be understood as a call for messianic Zionism or is intended as a prophecy,

Those who accept this criticism and remain troubled by this phrase, but who still desire to pray for the State of Israel with the prayer written by Rav Herzog, have a simple solution. Any perceived ambiguity can easily be clarified by the addition of the Hebrew word "*she-tihyeh*," so that the phrase "*reishit tzemichat geulateinu*" now reads "that it should be the beginning of our redemption." A number of synagogues have incorporated this change, elegantly eliminating this issue.

Other versions of the prayer for the State of Israel have been written by various halachic authorities, each with its own unique religious tone and linguistic style. For example, for a time the Aramaic phrase "*atchalta de-geulah*" ("the beginning of our redemption") was used instead of "*reishit tzemichat geulateinu*," as that was the phrase used in the 5709/1949 electoral platform of the joint religious parties in reference to the State of Israel, which was co-signed by many halachic luminaries, including Rav Yitzchak Isaac Herzog, *zt"l*, Rav Shlomo Zalman Auerbach, *zt"l*, Rav Yechezkal Sarna, *zt"l*, Rav Zalman Sorotzkin, *zt"l*, Rav Tzvi Pesach Frank, *zt"l*, and others. The full text issued in that pronouncement, which many later said as a prayer, was:

Praise to the Lord as we have been privileged, with His overwhelming mercy, that we have seen the initial flowers of the beginnings of redemption with the establishment of the State of Israel.

Whichever particular prayer one recites, one must see that the establishment of the State of Israel in the land of Israel has led to an unparalleled revival of Torah observance and learning in a broad variety of *yeshivot*, academies and schools; this would not have been the case absent Jewish sovereignty in the Jewish land, and we must thank the One who allowed this.

By 1945, the great Torah institutions of Europe and the vast majority of European Jewry had been tragically destroyed, and it is the (re)establishment of Torah institutions in Israel that has been our comfort and revival in the face of the nightmares that took place during World War II in Europe. Mourning our

losses and thanking the Almighty for His blessings are both indelible parts of the Torah's plan.

Thus, each of the many different Prayers for the State of Israel has its own linguistic and theological virtue. Like much of the practice relating to prayer, people should recite whichever prayer they are accustomed to saying, and whichever prayer reflects their world view (*hashkafa*) and ideology, as well as the ideology of their teachers, *rabbeim* and families, regarding how to express the belief that the return of Jewish sovereignty to the land of the Jewish people is of religious significance and a manifestation of the Divine.

This point returns us to *hashkafa*. Just as the selection of a particular prayer reflects a certain religious insight, so too the decision not to recite any prayer at all for the State of Israel is a hashkafic choice – a choice of mindset and orientation in Torah life that throws light on how one views modern events and the reestablishment of Jewish sovereignty in Israel.

The Young Israel of Toco Hills prides itself on being a synagogue that adheres to the Religious Zionist tradition, and thus views the establishment of the State of Israel in 5708/1948 as a historically positive development as well as a manifestation of the Divine. Within that mind set, one can discuss how exactly – with which precise prayer – one should thank the Divine for the State of Israel. All of the various permutations of how to pray for the State are legitimate.

We must, however, acknowledge that one can never "prove" with any absolute certainty that the State of Israel is a manifestation of the Divine worthy of a specific prayer. There are many deeply observant Jews – following the practice of well known halachic authorities – who do not agree with our understanding of the religious significance of the re-establishment of the State of Israel in 5708/1948. Indeed, some chassidim adhering to the philosophical position of the Satmar Rebbe, Rabbi Yoel Teitelbaum, *zt"l*, maintain that the State of Israel must be the "devil's work," and not a positive development in Jewish history.

Less stridently, but with equal clarity, others reject the validity of the Religious Zionist ideal, and deny that the establishment of the State of Israel is of any great religious significance at all – it is merely politically beneficial to the Jewish people. As Rabbi Avi Shafran, the editor of Agudath Israel's paper Coalition, put it, "The Jewish State, of course, never really was one at all, at least not in the deepest understanding of the word, 'Jewish.'"

Those who accept either of these two approaches do not say any prayer for the welfare of the state. In their view, the State of Israel does not merit a specific prayer of any type.

The Religious Zionist tradition vigorously disagrees with both of these approaches and accepts the approach of many Torah giants of the previous decades, who maintain that the establishment of the State of Israel is a manifestation of the Divine and of tremendous religious significance. As Rav Yosef Dov Soloveitchik stated:

Logically speaking, all religious Jews ought to belong to the Religious Zionist movement... I call upon all my students, wherever they are, to join the Religious Zionist movement and influence the members of their communities to do likewise... But for the Religious Zionist movement, religious Jews would not have been involved in building up the land, something that would have been a blot in the annals of religious Jewry which all the sermons and *pilpulim* in the world could not have erased.

There are a variety of possible prayers that one can say to thank our Creator for permitting the return of Jewish sovereignty to Israel and each of these prayers is a valid expression of Religious Zionism. As mentioned earlier, the Young Israel in Atlanta has chosen the one written by Rav Yitzchak Isaac Herzog, *zt"l*, the first chief rabbi of the State of Israel in 5708/1948, and this is the most common choice among synagogues in the United States that say a prayer for the State of Israel.

May we be privileged to see the full return of Jews to Israel and the full redemption of the Jewish people, as "From Zion, Torah shall go forth."

Michael J. Broyde is the rabbi of the Young Israel in Atlanta, a *dayan* in the Beth Din of America, and a professor of Law at Emory University. He can be contacted at mbroyde@law.emory.edu. This article, one in a series on ideology, can be found on the Young Israel web page at www.yith.org.